



## *Delegated Report*

*Report of Handling*

<b>Application Number:</b>	2015/0064/HAE
<b>Location:</b>	2 Dochart Road Killin Stirling FK21 8SN
<b>Proposal:</b>	Installation of replacement windows
<b>Case Officer:</b>	Julie Gray
<b>Target Decision Date:</b>	23 Apr 2015
<b>Decision Level:</b>	Delegated Decision

<b>1.</b>	<b>Introduction:</b>
	<p>The application site is a single storey semi-detached cottage located on the main road into Killin. The cottage is one of six, almost identical, semi-detached cottages in the row and is within Killin Conservation Area.</p> <p>Permission is sought to replace the existing single glazed timber sash and case windows with upvc double glazed windows.</p> <p>The key considerations are the principle of replacing the windows in the conservation area and the design of the proposed replacements.</p>
<b>2.</b>	<b>Relevant Planning History</b>
	--
<b>3.</b>	<b>Policy Context</b>
	<p><u>National Park Aims</u></p> <p>The four statutory aims of the National Park are a material planning consideration. These are set out in Section 1 of the National Parks (Scotland) Act 2000 and are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) to conserve and enhance the natural and cultural heritage of the area,</li> <li>(b) to promote sustainable use of the natural resources of the area,</li> <li>(c) to promote the understanding and enjoyment (including enjoyment in the form of recreation) of the special qualities of the area by the public and</li> <li>(d) to promote sustainable economic and social development of the area's communities.</li> </ul>

**LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY**

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

<p><u>National Park Local Plan (Adopted 2011)</u>  Relevant Policies:  ENV20 Conservation Areas  D1 Design Quality</p> <p><u>Other Material Considerations</u>  Historic Scotland Guidance, Managing Change in the Historic Environment, Windows. October 2010  Killin Conservation Area Appraisal</p> <p><u>National Park Partnership Plan (2012-2017)</u>  Relevant Policies:  Con Policy6: Cultural Heritage</p>	
<p><b>4. Consultations</b></p>	
<p><u>NP Built Heritage Advisor</u>  This property occupies an important site on the main approach to the village from the south, lying within the Killin Conservation Area. It is one of 6 semi-detached properties of similar style, single storey, slate roof, white roughcast and originally, timber sash and case windows with a distinctive 2x3 vertical paned glazing pattern. This property is the only one with surviving original windows. The others have all been replaced with modern materials. 3 properties replicate the original glazing pattern but with a different method of opening while the others, including the adjacent property to the application site, has adopted a different pattern with two panes of glass divided by a central transom and also open in a different manner.</p> <p>I have not visited the site, but from photographs, the windows look repairable. Repair would prolong their life, retaining the delicate astragals and safeguarding the character of the property. Options to refurbish and draught proof should be investigated.</p> <p>In a conservation area it is important that traditional building features in traditional materials are retained as they contribute significantly to its special character. It is unfortunate that the other properties have replaced the original window in the way that they have. The glazing pattern is an important characteristic of the properties and just because the neighbour has adopted two panes does not mean that it is correct and should be replicated. Upvc is also not considered a sustainable option.</p> <p>The new draft Planning Guidance for Listed buildings and Conservation Areas allows greater flexibility of material and method of opening to the rear, but as the application stands I would recommend that it be refused.</p>	
<p><b>5. Summary of Representations</b></p>	
<p>None</p>	
<p><b>6. Summary of Supporting Information</b></p>	
<p>None</p>	
<p><b>7. Planning Assessment</b></p>	
<p>The windows, which are proposed to be replaced, appear to be the original sash and case windows to the property. They are in a good condition and are capable of being repaired if required. Commentary on the location and surroundings of the property and other replacement windows is provided in section 4 above.</p> <p>The main policy consideration is policy ENV20 Conservation Areas. The relevant sections of this policy are noted below:</p> <p><i>Development and demolition within a conservation area or affecting its setting will only be supported where:</i></p>	

**LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY**

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 2 of 4

- a. *It preserves or enhances its character and appearance and is consistent with any relevant conservation area appraisal or management plan that may have been prepared:*
- b. *...replacement windows and doors on traditional buildings within conservation areas should normally match the original in relation to materials, proportions, method of opening and appearance.*

#### Principle

The Conservation Area Appraisal for Killin highlights original timber sash and case windows as one of the key features which defines the special architectural and historic character of the Conservation Area. Timber sash and case windows are a key building feature, which exemplify Scottish vernacular architecture and the use of traditional materials and construction techniques. The Conservation Area Appraisal states that the retention and repair of original architectural detail is a key challenge and the use of inappropriate materials results in a loss of character. The replacement of original timber windows with modern plastic substitutes is cited as an example of this.

Historics Scotland's Managing Change Guidance also states that 'maintenance and appropriate repair is the best means of safeguarding the historic character of a window'. Further to this, the guidance also states that 'significant improvements in energy efficiency can be achieved by discreet draught-stripping, internal secondary glazing and use of shutters/curtains at night'. There is therefore little justification in terms of energy efficiency to support the replacement of the single glazed windows with double glazed windows as alternative methods to aid energy efficiency are available.

The principle of replacing the original windows is therefore not supported by The Killin Conservation Area Appraisal or Historic Scotland Managing Change Guidance as original architectural detailing such as these windows should be retained due to the contribution they make to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and traditional building. In addition to this, no justification or reason has been provided for the replacement of the windows.

#### Design

The proposed replacement windows do not match the original in relation to materials, proportions, method of opening or appearance. This concern was raised with the agent, particularly in relation to the front elevation which would have the most significant impact on the appearance of the conservation area, however no changes have been made to the proposal.

It is noted that the policy states that windows should **normally** match the original, this is an allowance for the replacement of existing windows which are of an inappropriate design or materiality to be replaced with a more appropriate material. This allowance should not be used to allow original windows to be replaced with inappropriate replacements such as upvc.

The proposed design of the new windows is not acceptable and does not comply with policy ENV20.

#### Conclusion

The proposal is not supported by local plan policy ENV20, as it is not consistent with Killin Conservation Area Appraisal and the proposed replacement windows do not match the original in relation to materials, proportions, method of opening or appearance. The existing windows are in good condition and are capable of repair. Their replacement would have a cumulative effect on the erosion of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. The proposal is therefore recommended for refusal.

---

**Recommendation: Refuse**

#### **Planning Obligations**

N/A

---

#### **LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY**

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 3 of 4

## Reason for Decision

The proposal is not supported by local plan policy ENV20, as it is not consistent with Killin Conservation Area Appraisal and the proposed replacement windows do not match the original in relation to materials, proportions, method of opening or appearance. The existing windows are in good condition and are capable of repair. Their replacement would have a cumulative effect on the erosion of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

## List of Plans

Title	Reference	Date Received
Location Plan		24/02/15
General Existing and Proposed Elevations		25/02/15
General Window Specification		24/02/15

---

Signed: Julie Gray  
**Development Management Planner**

Dated: 14/04/15

## LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: [info@lochlomond-trossachs.org](mailto:info@lochlomond-trossachs.org) w: [lochlomond-trossachs.org](http://lochlomond-trossachs.org)

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 4 of 4