

# Report of Handling



**Application Number:** 2017/0054/HAE  
**Location:** Oakbank St Fillans Crieff PH6 2ND  
**Proposal:** Installation of 2No. replacement windows to front elevation  
**Case Officer:** Nicola Arnott  
**Target Decision Date:** 13 Apr 2017

<b>1. Introduction</b>
<p><u>Site Description:</u> Oakbank, St Fillans is a one and a half storey traditional mid-terrace villa located on the A85 within the Conservation Area of St Fillans.</p> <p><u>Proposal:</u> The proposal is for the replacement of the original timber sash and case windows on the principal elevation with double glazed UVPC windows.</p> <p>The key issues for consideration are: Principle of Development Design Impact on the character and setting of a Conservation Area</p>
<b>2. Relevant Planning History</b>
<p>2014/0227/HAE -Approve -28 October 2014 Creation of doorway and installation of French doors</p> <p>2015/0387/HAE -Approve -21 December 2015 Erection of free standing solar panel array</p> <p>2016/0258/HAE -Refuse -2 November 2016 Installation of replacement windows</p>
<b>3. Policy Context</b>
<p><u>Local Development Plan 2017-2021</u> Historic Environment Policy 2:</p> <p><u>Planning Guidance (draft)</u> Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas</p> <p><u>Historic Environment Scotland</u> Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Windows</p>
<b>4. Summary of Consultations</b>
<p><u>NP Built Heritage Advisor</u></p> <p>The National Park Authority's Planning Guidance for Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas is quite clear when it is proposed to replace timber sash and case windows in a conservation area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Replacement will only be considered if the original windows are beyond repair. This has to be supported by a specialist report.</li><li>• If the windows are considered to be beyond repair then the replacement windows on a front/public elevation must match the originals in terms of style, materials and method of opening, namely timber sliding sash and case with glazing pattern to match the original. In this case 2 panes over 2.</li></ul>

## LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 1 of 3

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Historic glass should be retained and, if present, secondary glazing should be considered.</li> </ul>
<b>5. Summary of Representations</b>	None
<b>6. Summary of Supporting Information</b>	Collection of photographs of non timber windows. Note that this document has not been annotated to describe the location or context of the non timber windows.
<b>7. Planning Assessment</b>	<p>The current application is a re-submission of the application made in 2016 (Ref: 2016/0258/HAE) for the replacement of original timber sash and case windows on the front elevation of the property. The 2016 application was refused in November 2016 for the following reason:</p> <p><i>The proposal is not supported by local plan policy ENV20, as it is not consistent with St Fillans Conservation Area Appraisal as the proposed replacement windows do not match the original in relation to materials, method of opening or appearance. Furthermore, the existing windows are in good condition and are capable of repair, and no justification has been given for the removal of the original windows. The proposal for replacement would have a cumulative effect on the erosion of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.</i></p> <p>That decision was not appealed through the Local Review Body which was a course of action open to the applicants. There is a 3 month timescale from the date of refusal for such appeals.</p> <p><u>Principle of Development</u></p> <p>The principle of replacing original timber sash and case windows is not supported by National Park policy. The relevant Local Development Plan policy, Historic Environment 2, states that development in Conservation Areas must be consistent with any relevant Conservation Area Appraisal. This proposal is in direct conflict with the policy.</p> <p>The Conservation Area Appraisal for St Fillans describes the designation of a conservation area as ‘a means to safeguard and enhance the special qualities, character and appearance of our most valued historic places.’ It sets out the key features that ‘define the special architectural and historic character of the Conservation Area and highlights timber sash and case windows as an example of the traditional materials that contribute significantly to its character. Timber sash and case windows are a key building feature exemplifying Scottish vernacular architecture and the use of traditional materials and construction techniques. Key challenges for the Conservation Area are also set out in the appraisal and include the loss of architectural detail and the pressure to replace rather than restore or repair features such as timber sash and case windows. The replacement of original timber windows with modern plastic substitutes is cited as an example of where the use of inappropriate materials results in a loss of character.</p> <p>The National Park’s Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Planning Guidance states that all development proposals in Conservation Areas should enhance or preserve these areas and where possible, repairs, restoration and re-use (not replacement) should be the first option.</p> <p>Historic Environment Scotland’s <i>Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Windows</i> guidance also states that maintenance and appropriate repair is the best means of safeguarding the historic character of a window. If a window is beyond repair, this guidance states that replacements must match the original window design as closely as possible. Further to this, the guidance also states that ‘significant improvements in energy efficiency can be achieved by discreet draught-stripping, internal secondary glazing and use of shutters/curtains at night’. There is therefore little justification in terms of energy efficiency to support the replacement of the single glazed windows with double glazed windows as alternative methods to aid energy efficiency are available.</p> <p>The agent was requested to submit a specialist report on the condition of the windows to support the application. This approach is in accordance with policy and guidance and also in line with the Built Heritage Adviser comments. No specialist report, supporting information or justification was submitted with the previous or the current application for the proposal to replace rather than repair the windows. From their appearance, it has been assessed that the original windows are capable of repair as they are</p>

**LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY**

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 2 of 3

in good condition.

There is a robust policy framework around the principle of repairing original features such as the sash and case windows and the principle of replacing the original windows with UPVC alternatives is not supported by policy.

#### Design

The consideration of the design merits of the proposed window is secondary to the consideration of the principle in this case as the principle of replacement rather than repair is in conflict with the policy framework. It is worth noting, however, that the proposed replacement windows do not match the original in terms of appearance or their method of opening as they are 'tilt' opening and not a sliding opening – a traditional feature. These concerns were raised with the agent during both this application and the previous application but no changes to the proposal have been made.

#### Impact on the Conservation Area

The site is in a very prominent location in the Conservation Area as it fronts onto the main street in St Fillans. The dwelling house is part of a row of three terraced properties all of which feature original timber windows on the principal elevation. The loss of these original architectural features on the principal elevation is not supported in policy terms as set out above. It would result in a significant adverse impact on the appearance of the conservation area.

#### Conclusion

The proposed replacement of the original windows is unacceptable in the Conservation Area and is contrary to policy. Policies state that original architectural details such as timber sash and case windows should be retained due to the positive contribution they make to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. No justification has been given for the replacement of the original windows and their replacement would contribute to the erosion of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. The proposal is therefore recommended for refusal.

### **Recommendation: Refuse**

#### **Reason for Decision:**

The proposal is not supported by Local Development Plan Historic Environment 2 policy as it is not consistent with St Fillans Conservation Area Appraisal as the proposed replacement windows do not match the original in relation to materials, method of opening or appearance. The original windows are in good condition and are capable of repair. Furthermore, no justification has been given for the replacement of the original windows. The replacement of the original sash and case windows would have a cumulative effect on the erosion of the character and appearance of the St Fillans Conservation Area.

#### **List of Plans**

<b>Title</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Date Received</b>
Location Plan		14/02/17
Proposed Elevations	SN2631AW1	14/02/17
Sections		14/02/17

Signed: Nicola Arnott  
**Development Management Planner**

Dated: 30.03.2017

### **LOCH LOMOND & THE TROSSACHS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY**

National Park Headquarters, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch, G83 8EG Long: 4°34'24"W Lat: 56°00'12"N

t: 01389 722600 f: 01389 722633 e: info@lochlomond-trossachs.org w: lochlomond-trossachs.org

Printed on paper sourced from certified sustainable forests

Page 3 of 3