

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting



Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Present: George Freeman – Depute Chair
Colin Bayes (CB)
David McKenzie (DMcK)
David Warnock (DW)
Willie Nisbet (WN)
Hazel Sorrell (HS)
Angus Allan (AA)
Fergus Wood (FW)

In Attendance: Park Authority Staff
Stuart Mearns, Head of Planning & Rural Development (SM)
Bob Cook, Development & Implementation Manager (BC)
Craig Jardine, Development Management Planner (CJ)
Erin Goldie, Development Management Planner (EG)
Susan Brooks, Forward Planning Planner (SB)
Amanda Aikman, Governance & Legal Manager (AAik)
Sharon McIntyre, Committee Officer (SMcl) – Clerk

Speakers
Pelham Olive (PO)
Jeannette Ellwood (JE)
Ewan Hardy (EH)

Apologies: Petra Biberbach (PB) – Chair and David McCowan (DMcC)

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
1	<p>Welcome and Apologies</p> <p>The Depute Chair welcomed those present to the meeting. The Depute Chair advised that as a result of the Chair, PB, being absent, he would be chairing this meeting. The Depute Chair explained that during this meeting in public, the case officers and speakers will present although other members of the public are unable to speak during the meeting. The Depute Chair invited the committee and officers to introduce themselves.</p> <p>SMcl advised that apologies had been received from PB and DMcC.</p>	
2	<p>Declarations of Interest</p> <p>No declarations of interest were made.</p>	
3	<p>Draft minutes of meeting held on Monday 28th September 2015</p> <p>The minute was proposed by CB and seconded by DMcK.</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
 John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
4	<p>Matters Arising</p> <p>The Chair noted one open action remains on the matters arising although this will be addressed at agenda item seven.</p>	
5	<p>2015/0209/PPP - Land to the Rear of Gartocharn Church, Gartocharn Erection of 3 No. dwellinghouses and a building comprising therapy centre and short term accommodation (Class 8 - Residential Institution)</p> <p>The Depute Chair introduced this agenda item advising that this report recommends that Members agree to convene a special meeting of the Planning and Access Committee on Wednesday 2nd December 2015 to consider the application comprising a site visit followed by a planning hearing.</p> <p>The Depute Chair advised that the planning officer, EG, is present should Members have any questions in relation to this agenda item. Members had no questions and agreed to the recommendation outlined in the report.</p> <p>DECISION: Members approved that a special meeting of the Planning and Access Committee be convened and that this should be held on Wednesday 2nd December 2015 to consider the application comprising a site visit followed by a planning hearing.</p>	
6	<p>2015/0124/DET - Land to the South of Cuilimuich Carrick Castle, Lochgoilhead Argyll</p> <p>Erection of lodge building comprising a mixed use of guest house/hostel (Class 7), estate business office space (Class 4) and residential and non-residential research and learning facility (Class 8 & 10); Erection of estate manager's dwellinghouse/office; Erection of ancillary services and meeting facilities building; and formation of associated parking, yard and landscaping.</p> <p>The Depute Chair introduced this agenda item advising firstly that a late representation had been received from the Carrick Residents' Group along with a request to postpone the meeting today. The Depute Chair advised that the points raised within the late representation will be addressed in the officer's presentation. The Depute Chair also advised that the meeting today will proceed with this agenda item and that it would be up to the Committee, having heard all the presentations and speakers, to decide at that time if there should be any postponement.</p> <p>The Depute Chair asked that JE address any points made in the late representation on behalf of Carrick Residents' Group during her four minute presentation. The Depute Chair confirmed that all speakers will be allowed</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
 John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>four minutes to speak and that the order of the speakers would be PO in support of the application followed by JE and EW in objection to the application.</p> <p>The Depute Chair invited CJ to introduce the application. CJ advised that this application is for the erection of a multi-purpose estate lodge and estate manager's dwellinghouse (linked with a service block) situated close to the eastern entrance to Carrick Estate, at Carrick Castle. CJ informed Members that there has been a significant level of objection to the proposal, comprising of 32 objections. The Loch Goil Community Council for the area has also lodged an objection.</p> <p><i>SB joined the meeting.</i></p> <p>CJ provided information on the location of the site and the proposed development through a series of maps and photographs. CJ advised that the application site is located outwith, and to the rear of, the settlement boundary of Carrick Castle situated on the shore of Loch Goil. CJ outlined the intended use of the buildings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The estate manager's dwellinghouse will provide on-site living accommodation and office space for the manager and their family. Allowing for a full-time presence on the estate and to fulfil the needs of the estate. - The estate lodge will offer flexible accommodation to support visitors to the estate. It is proposed that these visitors may be involved in eco-tourism, research scientists, deer stalking guests, visiting school groups, day guests and occasional guests of the owner. - It is also proposed that the lodge and meeting space within the service building would provide a venue for community meetings. - The service building contains the service plant room, laundry facilities and will act as a field lounge or meeting point. - The shed will be for forestry purposes and has been approved in a separate application. <p>CJ advised that, apart from Loch Goil Community Council, no objections have been received from statutory or non-statutory consultees.</p> <p>CJ noted the representations received outlined in section 4.10 to 4.19 of the report.</p> <p>CJ concluded the presentation outlining that the officer recommendation was to approve the application subject to the imposition of the conditions set out in appendix one of the report.</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
 John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>The Depute Chair invited discussion by Members.</p> <p>Members asked how many jobs are expected to be created as a result of this proposed development. CJ advised that the number of employees has not been confirmed although that this would be in accordance with the management of the estate.</p> <p>Members requested clarification on the location of the proposed development in relation to the settlement boundary. CJ explained this through referring to a series of maps in the presentation.</p> <p>Members discussed the usage of the proposed development and enquired if there required to be any restrictions should there be a future proposed change of use. CJ advised that the lodge has a description that would only enable a specific range of use. Any alternative use would require a future application. The manager's house, use and occupation would be restricted by condition.</p> <p>Members discussed whether the current network of tracks through the estate would be connected. CJ advised that a separate application would be required to consider the addition of any new tracks.</p> <p>Following discussion by Members, the Depute Chair invited PO to speak and he outlined the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The application for this proposed development has been made having regard to the policies of the Park Authority. - Regeneration of the land and encouraging biodiversity is outlined in the estate management plan. PO advised that the lodge will provide an income sufficient to cover the running costs of the estate until income from timber is viable. - Support from members of the local community has been received and that this proposed development will be a benefit to the local community and tourists. <p>Members asked PO whether he could expand on the expected uptake of the activities proposed at the lodge. PO advised that he believes that there would be an interest in the site from research scientists. In relation to deer stalking he advised that it is not intended to be a sporting lodge. PO also advised that in due course he wishes to develop more public footpaths on the estate.</p> <p>Following discussion by Members, the Chair invited JE to speak on behalf of the Carrick Residents' Group and she outlined the following points:</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
 John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>The refusal of an earlier planning application in this area as a result of this being:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Contrary to the first aim of the Park Authority. - The proposal would have impacted upon the landscape setting of the existing settlement and would therefore have an adverse impact on maintaining and enhancing the landscape quality of Loch Goil and the settlement of Carrick. <p>In drawing this comparison JE further commented on the development as now proposed as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The building is outwith the existing village envelope and is contrary to the statutory aim of preventing incremental development and expansion into the countryside. - The proposed development site being located at the edge of an open hillside would be contrary to the first aim of the National Park. - The applicant's inclusion of Ben Lawer as a similar development is not an appropriate comparison. - There is a conflict between the estate management and National Park aim to conserve and enhance natural and cultural heritage in relation to the management of the deer population. <p>Members discussed the business plan for the estate. SM highlighted to Members that the business case is an indication of intent.</p> <p>Members discussed the previous application to the site. SM advised that this was assessed against the relevant policies applicable at the time of that application.</p> <p>Following discussion by Members, the Depute Chair invited EH to speak on behalf of Lochgoil Community Council and he outlined the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Concern against setting a precedent for building outwith the village boundary. - Involvement with the local community was initially suggested by the applicant although this has not been followed through. - There is no guarantee that local people will be appointed in the jobs created. - It has been advised that this development can be used by the local community however the local community does not feel that these facilities are required. <p>Members discussed the positioning of this development outwith the settlement boundary. SM advised that this proposed development is in accordance with our tourism and rural business need policies.</p> <p>DMcK proposed that a site visit was required to the land to the South of Cuilimuich Carrick Castle, Lochgoilhead Argyll. FW seconded this proposal.</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
 John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>The Depute Chair then invited Members to indicate their support for the motion proposing a site visit was required to the application site at the land to the South of Cuilimuich Carrick Castle, Lochgoilhead Argyll.</p> <p>All Members were in support of the motion proposing a site visit prior to determining this application.</p> <p>DECISION: Members deferred the determination of the application pending a site visit by the Committee to be arranged at a future date.</p> <p>SM confirmed that Members who take part in the site visit will then be able to take part in the subsequent committee meeting to address this agenda item.</p> <p><i>Members of the public, WN, CJ and EG left the meeting at this point.</i></p>	
7	<p>Affordable Housing: Investment and Commuted Sums</p> <p>SB introduced this report outlining that it provides an update on the details of investment in affordable housing delivery within the National Park arising from the four Local Authority Strategic Housing Investment Plans and also from commuted sums generated within the National Park as requested by the Committee.</p> <p>SB outlined that the officer recommendation is to note the content of this report and that future updates will be reported bi-annually to the Planning and Access Committee.</p> <p>Members discussed the sites detailed in the report and noted that it would be beneficial in the future to show the amount of funding secured from each local authority in the reports and track the funds received from commuted sums.</p> <p>DECISION: Members noted the content of the report and that future updates will be reported bi-annually to the Planning and Access Committee.</p>	
8	<p>Any Other Business</p> <p>DMcK briefed the committee on the Finnartmore housing development in Kilmun, highlighting that a local lettings initiative is being considered to allow a committee of local residents to be involved in the process of allocating properties when this begins in spring 2016.</p> <p><i>HS left the meeting.</i></p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 27th October 2015, 13:30hrs
John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
9	Date of Next Meeting The next meeting of the Planning & Access Committee will take place on Monday 23 rd November 2015.	

Signed _____
George Freeman, Depute Chair