

National Park Authority Planning & Access Committee Meeting



Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 24th June 2019, 13:30hrs
John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Present: Ellen Morton – Chair
Bob Darracott (BD) – Depute Chair
Graham Lambie (GL)
Willie Nisbet (WN)
Claire Chapman (CC)
David McCowan (DMcC)
Murray Lyle (ML)
Christopher Spray (CS)
Diane Docherty (DD)
Billy Ronald (BR) – Agenda items 1 - 4
Martin Earl (ME)

In Attendance: Park Authority Staff
Stuart Mearns, Director of Rural Development and Planning (SM)
Bob Cook, Development Management Manager (Delivery) (BC)
Catherine Stewart, Development Management Manager (Performance and Support) (CSte)
Alison Williamson, Development Management Planner (AW)
Fiona Stewart, Natural Heritage Planning Advisor (FS)
Sharon McIntyre, Committee Officer (SMcl) – Clerk

Alastair McKie, Legal Clerk, Anderson Strathern LLP (AM)

Speakers: Mr James Morrison – Agenda item 4
Mrs Janet McDonald – Agenda item 4
Mr Peter Page – Agenda item 4

Apologies: Ronnie Erskine (RE)

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
1	<p>Welcome and Apologies</p> <p>The Chair welcomed those present to the meeting.</p> <p>The Chair advised that apologies had been received from RE.</p>	
2	<p>Declarations of Interest</p> <p>CS wished to note that he is the Chairman of the UK Government's Special Protection Area/Ramsar Scientific Working Group, however this is a highly strategic role and therefore he advised he would be able to take part in agenda item 4.</p> <p>BR declared an interest in agenda item 5, a close relative has shares in Scotgold.</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 24th June 2019, 13:30hrs

John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>WN declared an interest in agenda item 4 as a historical tenant of JM who is a speaker today.</p>	
<p>3</p>	<p>Draft minute of meeting held on 29th April 2019</p> <p>The minute was proposed for approval by EM and seconded by WN. The minute was therefore approved by the Committee.</p> <p><i>WN left the room.</i></p>	
<p>4</p>	<p>2016/0126/DET - Wards Estate, Gartocharn</p> <p>Consideration of Item</p> <p>Planning Officer (AW) presented the planning application noting that this application must be determined by the Planning and Access Committee in accordance with the Park Authority's Scheme of Delegation due to the formal objection from Kilmarnock Community Council and the number of representations received.</p> <p>AW advised that at the date of the preparation of the report 48 representations had been received; comprising of 45 from individuals and 3 from organisations, namely Friends of Loch Lomond, Loch Lomond Fisheries Trust and Greenland White Fronted Goose Study Group.</p> <p>6 of these representations were made in support of the planning application. 2 neutral representations were received. 40 representations were received objecting to the planning application, including one from Jackie Baillie MSP.</p> <p>Section 4 of the report provides a summary of the consultation responses and representations received.</p> <p>AW put forward the recommendation of the Director of Rural Development and Planning, to refuse the application for the reasons set out in Appendix 1 of the report.</p> <p>Members asked questions of officers and discussion took place regarding the proposed application, points covered included the scale of the development, the Habitats Regulations in relation to the proposed development and the applicant's business plan.</p> <p>SPEAKER: Mr James Morrison who was speaking on behalf of the applicant was then invited to address the Committee. He did so in support of the application.</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 24th June 2019, 13:30hrs

John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	<p>Members asked questions of Mr James Morrison and officers. Discussion took place regarding the application.</p> <p>SPEAKER: Mrs Janet McDonald who was speaking on behalf of herself and Mr McDonald was then invited to address the Committee. She did so in objection of the application.</p> <p>Members asked questions of Mrs Janet McDonald and officers. Discussion took place regarding the application.</p> <p>SPEAKER: Mr Peter Page who was speaking on behalf of himself was then invited to address the Committee. He did so in objection of the application.</p> <p>Members asked questions of Mr Peter Page and officers. Discussion took place regarding the application.</p> <p>Following all speakers being heard the Chair asked if they had received a fair hearing. A further point was raised by Mrs Janet McDonald. Speakers were in agreement that they had received a fair hearing. Members discussed the proposed development further, points covered included the manger's house, the tree survey, the travel action plan and noise.</p> <p>MOTION: DD seconded by BD, proposed that the application be refused for the reasons set out in Appendix 1 of the report.</p> <p>AMENDMENT: ME seconded by ML, proposed an amendment to the recommendation that the application be refused for the reasons set out in Appendix 1 of the report excluding reasons for refusal 5 and 6.</p> <p>AM then put the motion and the amendment to the members.</p> <p><u>Voting</u></p> <p>For the motion - 7 votes (EM, BD, DD, DMcC, GL, BR and CS)</p> <p>For the amendment - 3 votes (ME, ML and CC)</p> <p>DECISION: Accordingly, the decision of the Planning & Access Committee was to refuse the application for the reasons set out in Appendix 1 of the report.</p> <p><i>WN returned to the room.</i></p> <p><i>BR left the meeting.</i></p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 24th June 2019, 13:30hrs

John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
5	<p>Cononish Update</p> <p>Consideration of Item</p> <p>Planning Manager (CSte) presented the report to update members on the Cononish Gold and Silver Mine near Tyndrum as works have commenced on site and outlined how this is being monitored by the Park Authority.</p> <p>CSte put forward the recommendation of the Director of Rural Development and Planning, to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consider and Note the updates on the development and the proposed future annual reporting of progress and activity. <p>Members asked questions of officers. Discussion took place regarding the report.</p> <p>Members requested a site visit to the Cononish Gold and Silver Mine near Tyndrum.</p> <p>ACTION: Dates to be provided to members of when they can join Planning Officers to visit to the Cononish Gold and Silver Mine near Tyndrum.</p> <p>Following discussion, the Chair proposed a motion supporting the officer's recommendation.</p> <p>MOTION: The Chair, seconded by DMcC proposed to note:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. the updates on the development and 2. the proposed future annual reporting of progress and activity. <p>DECISION: As no competent amendment was tabled, the above motion became the decision of the Committee.</p>	SM/SMcl
6	<p>Any Other Business</p> <p>SM advised members that the Planning (Scotland) Bill has been passed by the Scottish Parliament and provided an update on the notable changes.</p> <p>ACTION: SM to circulate to members an update on the notable changes to the Planning (Scotland) Bill.</p>	SM
7	<p>Date of Next Meeting</p> <p>The next meeting of the Planning & Access Committee will take place on 29th July 2019. The Chair informed members that case work is expected for this</p>	

National Park Authority

Planning & Access Committee Meeting

Draft Minutes of Meeting held on 24th June 2019, 13:30hrs
John Muir Suite, Carrochan, Carrochan Road, Balloch

Item	Title / Discussion	Action by
	meeting.	

Signed _____
Ellen Morton, Chair