



# Draft Minutes of Meeting Held at 13:30hrs on 26 February 2024 at Four Seasons Hotel, St Fillans

## Planning and Access Committee

29 April 2024

Paper for approval

---

Attendees .....	2
Apologies .....	2
Items and Actions.....	3
1. Welcome and Apologies .....	3
2. Declarations of Interest.....	3
3. Minutes of Previous Meeting:.....	3
4. 2021/0256/DET - Erection of 18 houses with associated access and landscaping at Land to the West of Station Road St Fillans.....	4
5. Vale of Leven Windfarm Consultation Response.....	6
6. Any Other Business .....	7
7. Date of Next Meeting .....	7

## **Attendees**

Claire Chapman (CC) Chair

David Mackie (DM)

William Sinclair (WS) Depute Chair

Chris Spray (CS)

Ronnie Erskine (RE)

Shonny Paterson (SP)

David Fettes (DF)

## **In Attendance – National Park Authority staff**

Stuart Mearns, Director of Place (SM)

Jennifer Paton, Planning Officer (JP)

Alison Williamson, Development Management Planner (AW)

Bob Cook, Development Manager (BC)

Fiona Stewart, Landscape Advisor (FS)

Dougie Smith, Corporate Performance Manager (DS) – Governance Clerk and Minutes

## **Also In Attendance**

Chris Devlin, Legal Clerk, Anderson Strathern LLP (CD)

Navid Foroutan, Boardroom Apprentice (NF)

## **Apologies**

Hazel Sorrell

Matin Earl

Richard Johnson

## Items and Actions

### 1. Welcome and Apologies

The Chair welcomed attendees to this meeting of the Planning & Access Committee and thanked the Four Seasons Hotel for hosting during the ongoing work to the building at National Park Headquarters.

The Chair welcomed the members of the public attending in person from the community.

The Chair welcomed NF.

The Chair invited all participants to introduce themselves.

The Chair advised that Hazel Sorrell, Martin Earl and Richard Johnson were not in attendance and had submitted their apologies.

CD confirmed that this meeting was quorate.

### 2. Declarations of Interest

CC declared her role as an employee of Scottish Water and confirmed that she had no involvement with this application and does not work in the department relevant to the application. Noted and accepted.

### 3. Minutes of Previous Meeting:

Meeting held on 18<sup>th</sup> December 2023:

**Decision:** DM, seconded by WS, proposed the approval of the minutes of the meeting of 18<sup>th</sup> December 2023. The minutes were approved unanimously by a show of hands.

CD confirmed the decision of the committee.

#### **4. 2021/0256/DET - Erection of 18 houses with associated access and landscaping at Land to the West of Station Road St Fillans**

JP presented the officer's report, alongside a PowerPoint presentation. Questions from Members followed for JP. Questions were posed to JP relating to:

- Sewage capacity
- Affordable housing allocation
- Parking spaces
- Biodiversity enhancement

The agent, on behalf of the applicant, Mark Myles (Bidwells) spoke in support of the application. Questions from Members followed. Rod Paul (Denholm Partnership Architects) & Brian Coghlan (Atholl Associates), on behalf of the applicant, assisted Mr Myles in addressing Members' questions.

Pauline Jenkins, speaking as an individual, spoke in support of the application. Questions from Members followed.

Audrey Gavigan, on behalf of St Fillans Community Council, spoke in objection to the application. Questions from Members followed.

Paul Aitken, speaking as an individual, spoke in objection to the application. Questions from Members followed.

Questions from Members to the Speakers related to:

- Affordable housing allocation marketing
- Drainage and flooding
- Parking spaces on the site – clarifying the role of Perth and Kinross Council Roads Department
- Condition of waste pump
- Drainage and flooding concerns
- Proximity of new plots to existing houses
- Access path
- Planning consent period

Further discussion took place between Members. Further points discussed included consideration of:

- Sewage infrastructure
- Status of Broadband as a utility service

- Water pressure – confirming that Scottish Water have not objected to the proposal

**MOTION:** DM, seconded by WS, proposed to approve the recommendation as follows:

That Members: **APPROVE** the application subject to the conditions set out in **Appendix 1** and the Section 75 Heads of Terms set out in **Appendix 2** of the report.

**DECISION:** By unanimous decision, the **motion** became the decision of the Committee.

CD confirmed the decision of the committee.

## 5. Vale of Leven Windfarm Consultation Response

AW presented the officer's report alongside a PowerPoint presentation. Questions from Members followed.

The main points of the discussion included consideration of:

- Height and size of turbines proposed
- Nighttime effect of proposed turbines
- NatureScot's landscape comments

**MOTION:** CS, seconded by DM, proposed to approve the recommendation as follows:

That Members: **APPROVE** the contents of the report and its submission to the Scottish Government Energy Consents Unit, as the National Park Authority's consultation response on the application. The response concludes that the National Park Authority **objects** to the proposal for the following reasons:

- Given the extremely large turbine size, the proposed development would often appear dominant or very prominent in the backdrop to the southern part of Loch Lomond and its associated rural setting. With a very intrusive and industrial appearance, the turbines would considerably detract from, contrast with and often compromise a very large number of Special Landscape Qualities and key characteristics that are integral to defining this iconic part of the National Park.
- The views and visual amenity of a very large number of visitors and residents of several settlements would be subject to widespread significant visual effects.
- Parts of at least (approximately) 75km of nationally important recreational routes would be subject to significant visual impacts.
- The proposed development would compromise the objectives of the National Park designation and its overall integrity.
- The proposed development would conflict with National and local landscape-related policy.

**DECISION:** The **motion** became the decision of the Committee by unanimous decision.

CD confirmed the decision of the committee.

## **6. Any Other Business**

- SM updated Members and took any questions from Members on the Loch Long Fish Farm appeal process. SM confirmed that the Reporter has submitted to Scottish Government Ministers.
- SM updated Members and took any questions from Members on Planning Application 2017/0254/MIN – Cononish Gold Mine, Tyndrum. SM confirmed that SGZ is not in administration. SM confirmed that the site remains in a care and maintenance regime. SM provided assurance that mitigation and remedial works are in place following discussions. SM confirmed that SEPA continue to monitor the site alongside the National Park Authority. SM confirmed the status of Bond holdings relating to the site.

## **7. Date of Next Meeting**

The date of next meeting of the Planning & Access Committee is scheduled for 25 March 2024, dependant on business.

Signed

---